श्री सुरेश पचौरी: महोदया, सैशन के समय इस प्रकार के हस्ताक्षर करना बहुत गलत है। यहां एक तरफ अलग-अलग मंत्री आपस में लड़ रहे हैं और वहां डब्ल्यू. टी. ओ. पर दस्तखत किए जा रहे हैं ...(**व्यवधान**)... इस प्रकार के दस्तखत करना सदन की अवमानना है। सदन को विश्वास में लेना चाहिए।

SHRIMATI JAYANTHI NATARAJAN (Tamil Nadu): Parliament must be taken into confidence ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: महोदया, डब्ल्यू.टी.ओ. का फैसला भारत के खिलाफ फैसला है ...(**व्यवधान**)... सदन में बहस हो, सदन की राय ली जाए, उसके बाद कोई फैसला किया जाए। You adjourn the House...*(Interruptions)*... बुलाइए प्राईम-मिनिस्टिर को, जब तक वह नहीं आते, अपने विचार सदन में नहीं रखते, सदन की बात नहीं सुनते, तब तक हाऊस ऐडजॉर्न कर दीजिए ...(**व्यवधान**)...

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA (West Bengal): Parliament must be taken into confidence ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If Members agree, till I get the Prime Minister, shall we do some business? ...*(Interruptions)*...

HON. MEMBERS: No, no ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: You must ask the Government to explain ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: We can adjourn the House ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA: The Minister is here. Let him speak out ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: We want the Prime Minister here ...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री राजनाथ सिंह (उत्तर प्रदेश): मैडम, जब तक प्राईम मिनिस्टिर सदन में नहीं आते, सदन की कार्यवाही हम नहीं चलने देंगे ...(**व्यवधान**)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, I will adjourn the House ...*(Interruptions)*... How can I call him now? ...*(Interruptions)*... Until I go and talk to him I cannot give an answer ...*(Interruptions)*... Let me find out. I have to find out. I will adjourn the house till 2 o' clock. Meanwhile I will find out from the Government ...*(Interruptions)*... Today is Private Members' day and we have only half an hour from 2 to 2.30. If you don't want, I can adjourn the House till 2 o' clock. The House is adjourned till 2 O' clock.

The House then adjourned at seven f minutes past twelve of the clock till 2 PM.

2.00 P.M.

The House reassembled after lunch at two minute past two of the clock, **The Deputy Chairman** *in the Chair.*

RE. MINISTERIAL CONFERENCE OF W.T.O. AT SINGAPORE—*Contd.*

श्री मोहम्मद सलीम (पश्चिम बंगाल): मैडम, स्टेटमेंट का क्या हुआ? ...(**व्यवधान**)...

†[اشری محمد سلیم: میڈم - اسٹیٹمنٹ کا کیا ہوا - ...مداخلت...]

श्री नरेन्द्र मोहन (उत्तर प्रदेश): मैडम, प्रधान मंत्री जी को यहां आना था ...(**व्यवधान**)...

उपसभापति: प्रधान मंत्री जी का तो मुझे मालूम नहीं, गवर्नमेंट इधर है, मैं पूछती हूं कि क्या हुआ?

श्री महेश्वर सिंह (हिमाचल प्रदेश): मैडम, सरकार है ही नहीं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

उपसभापति: कितने मंत्री यहां बैठे हैं? ...(**व्यवधान**)...

श्री महेश्वर सिंह: मैडम, सरकार होती तो यह दुर्दशा न होती। सरकार तो है ही नहीं। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Let us hear the Minister.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY (Pondicherry): There was no response in the morning, when the issue was raised by the hon. Members, to tell the Members what had happened in Singapore on WTO.

श्री नरेन्द्र मोहन: मैडम, व्यापार के नाम पर राष्ट्र का शोषण तो होने नहीं दिया जाएगा।

संसदीय कार्य मंत्री तथा पर्यटन मंत्री (श्री श्रीकान्त जेना): बात तो सुन लीजिए पहले। उसके बाद बोलना है, बोलिए। ...(**व्यवधान**)...

---

†[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script.

SHRI SRIKANT JENA: The delegation headed by the Commerce Minister is at the moment at Singapore. Since the issue was raised in the House, whatever information was received from the delegation at Singapore indicates the following: 1. That the Ministers have categorically stated that the International Labour Organisation is the competent body to deal with core labour standards. The conference has rejected the use of restrictive trade measures to enforce labour standards. The conference has emphasised that the competitive advantage of developing countries should not be put in question in any way. It has promised its continued support to work done by the Labour Ministers in the ILO. Thus, India's position has been reflected in the Declaration. 2. The initial proposal to evolve an educative process and establish working groups as a prelude to negotiating a multi-lateral agreement on investment has not been accepted by the conference. As the situation was, all countries barring India were inclined to take up matters relating to investment and competition policy on the basis of existing WTO provisions including the TRIMs Agreement. Hence, they were inclined to establish working groups to examine the relationship between trade and investment and trade and competition policy. However, even while opposing the idea of working groups, India insisted on two important riders. These riders were added and received substantial support even in the face of opposition by some developed countries. The conference has made it clear that the work done by the working groups shall not pre-judge the question whether negotiations will be initiated in future and that it would be clearly understood that future negotiations, if any, will take place only after an explicit consensus decision among the WTO Members regarding such negotiations.

The Ministers have also welcomed the work under way in UNCTAD and have expressly stated that they encourage cooperation between UNCTAD and WTO. While India has been able to persuade the member countries to reject any reference to a multilateral agreement on investment or to begin an educative process, India is unhappy even with the revised formulation to establish working groups to study the issues. India's unhappiness has been expressed in a press conference taken by the Commerce Minister earlier today.

The issue of core labour standards and the issue of working groups to study trade and investment, and trade and competition policy are reflected only in the Declaration and no agreements have been signed in this behalf.

On information technology, an agreement was arrived at. While some member-countries have signed the agreement, India has declined to sign the agreement.

...(Interruptions)...

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Madam, I have a number of questions to ask. My first point is, before anything is done, the Government should have circulated a copy of the text because there is a strong opposition to it *...(Interruptions)...* Please allow me to speak. There is a strong opposition to it. It is a very sensitive subject. On the basis of the statement which has been made by the Commerce Minister, it is totally unclear as to the nature of the text or the wording of the text. I would suggest, let the Minister take the responsibility of circulating a copy of the text and the report of the press conference over the week end. Only after the issue is studied in depth can there be a meaningful discussion in the House. Until then, there cannot be a proper discussion in this House *...(Interruptions)...*

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: आप जरा कंपीटेटिव लफ्ज के बाद के पार्ट को फिर से पढ़ दीजिए ...(व्यवधान)...

†[جناب سکندر بخت: آپ ذرا کمپی ٹیٹیو لفظ کے بعد کے پارٹ کو پھر سے پڑھ دیجئے ... مداخلت ...]

PROF. VIJAY KUMAR MALHOTRA (Delhi): Madam, we oppose setting up of the working groups.

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Madam, until Monday, there cannot be any proper discussion in this House. The House cannot function properly *...(Interruptions)...*

प्रो. विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा: हमने वर्किंग ग्रुप में अपोज किया है। क्या आपने साइन किए हैं? ...(व्यवधान)

†[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script.

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: मैडम, प्रधान मंत्री आयें तो उनसे सवाल करें। ...(व्यवधान)...

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: The Commerce Minister is away. But the Prime Minister is here. The Finance Minister is here. Even if the Commerce Minister is away in Singapore, they should have come to the House and responded to us.

SHRI SRIKANT KUMAR JENA: I am here, representing the Government.

SHRI V. NARAYANASAMY: Mr. Minister, will you be able to reply to the questions the Members would like to put? ...*(Interruptions)*...

You have talked about the educative process. Whom do you educate? Education for whom? Your party, when it was in opposition, insisted that Parliament be taken into confidence. Are you doing it now? Have you taken Parliament into confidence?

Gujralji, when you were sitting on this side, you used to say this. It is all on record. You said that without taking Parliament into confidence, no agreement, either on TRIMs or on TRIPs or on labour standards, should be signed. Why have you gone back now? Why did your Commerce Minister not take this House into confidence?...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. BIPLAB DASGUPTA: Madam, until Monday, there cannot be a proper discussion in this House...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: Madam, a copy of the text should be made available to all the Members...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NILOTPAL BASU (West Bengal): Madam, unless we go through the text, we would not be in a position to have any meaningful discussion in the House...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: We want to know whether the Commerce Minister has taken Parliament into confidence? If not, who will take us into confidence?

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: महोदया, विश्व व्यापार संगठन में यह एग्रीमेंट नये भविष्य के लिए एक बहुत अहम कदम है। आप उस पर दस्तखत करें या न करें, उसका फैसला जब सदन चल रहा है तो उस पर सदन में पूरी बहस करके, पूरा विचार-विमर्श करके उसके बाद लेने का है। परन्तु दुर्भाग्यपूर्ण बात यह है कि जब सदन का सत्र चल रहा है उस वक्त गवर्नमेंट को ऐसा स्टैंड नहीं लेना चाहिए। यह कोई मामूली स्टैंड नहीं है कि किसी को नौकरी देनी है या किसी को नौकरी से बर्खास्त करना है। एक नई परम्परा की शुरूआत होने वाली है 21वीं सदी में। यह वर्ल्ड ट्रेड ओर्गनाइजेशन सारे विश्व के व्यापार संगठनों पर अपना अधिपत्य जमाने वाला है। उसमें हम दस्तखत करें या न करें, इसका निर्णय हम सदन में बहस कर के ही ले सकते हैं। किन्तु हम इस मुद्दे को सदन के सामने रखे बगैर...(व्यवधान)

SHRI SRIKANT KUMAR JENA: It is irrelevant.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Don't say that it is irrelevant. How are you concerned with the issue? My point is entirely different. My point is, the whole nation is concerned with the issue. You are deciding the fate of 930 million people of this country. You cannot do that arbitrarily. You have got to discuss the matter with us. You must discuss the matter in the House. Only then can you take a decision.

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): Madam, I have a few points to submit...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Fernandes wants to say something...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, the issue is...*(Interruptions)*...

श्री एस. एस. अहलुवालिया: यह स्टेटमेंट पढ़कर आप समझते हैं कि आपने जवाब दे दिया।

(व्यवधान)

* ...(व्यवधान)...

प्रधानमंत्री जी को बुलाइए, वे जवाब दें। ...(व्यवधान)...

श्री श्रीकान्त जेना: आप कैसी बात कर रहे हैं?...(व्यवधान)...

उपसभापति: यह ठीक बात नहीं है।

DR. BIPLAB DAS GUPTA: No, no. You should not say this. You cannot say this. We

* Not recorded.

don't accept this, Madam. (*Interruptions*) How can you say that?

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: Ahluwaliaji, please...

DR. BIPLAB DAS GUPTA: You cannot question the competence of the Minister. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: It will not go on record. (*Interruptions*) मंत्री जी बोलना चाहते हैं, बोलने दीजिए।

SHRI SRIKANT KUMAR JENA: I think the Minister of...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: I am not asking you. I am not taking your support. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SRIKANT KUMAR JENA: Mr. Ahluwalia, please listen. (*Interruptions*) You can't listen to anybody. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: My point is simple. Let the Prime Minister come and reply to all our questions. Let the Prime Minister come. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one second. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: You are deciding the fate of this country...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one second. Ahluwaliaji, please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: And you are not a dictator that you can do like this. (*Interruptions*)

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Please sit down. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOM PAL (Uttar Pradesh): Madam Deputy Chairperson, ...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one second. (*Interruptions*) The thing is that he is speaking on behalf of the Government. He has the responsibility to react on behalf of the Government. So, to say that he is not competent to reply, is not true because...

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: No, Madam. I do not want to challenge his competence. I am saying that the concerned Minister should be here.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one second.

SHRI S. S. AHLUWALIA: He is a good friend of mine. I am not challenging his competence.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Just one second. (*Interruptions*) Let me set the record straight. (*Interruptions*) Let me set the record straight. (*Interruptions*) Just one second. He is the Minister for Parliamentary Affairs. The House was agitated. We adjourned it in the morning. Now he has come to respond. The Minister who should come and respond is in Singapore at the moment. Till he comes back, we can't have a meaningful discussion because we don't know what has happened there and what he has signed. So, that is the problem here. The Parliamentary Affairs Minister can come and give you the information that he gets from there. He cannot speak about what exactly happened there. So, we should give him at least that much credit that he came.

I am happy that you came. But I know that you do not know anything about what is happening there. And the House should know...(*Interruptions*) How can he know? He is not there. He is here.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: So, you have accepted my charge.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Yes. He cannot know and I do not know what is happening in Singapore. Till the Minister, who has really signed it or who had the negotiations there, comes back, we can't have any...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: But, Madam, after it is signed, what will we do?

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: So, there is no point in asking him whether...(*Interruptions*)

श्री श्रीकान्त जेना: सुन लो लीजिए, अहलुवालिया जी, I am just responding to your point ....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: You must take the Parliament into confidence.

SHRI SRIKANT KUMAR JENA: I am responding to your point, Ahluwaliaji. ...(*Interruptions*)

श्री सिकन्दर बख्त: आपका बयान पूरे तरीके से समझ में नहीं आया है और असल हिस्सा अभी उसका रह गया है। मैं आपसे कहना चाहता हूं कि कंपीटिटिव लफ्ज का आपने जहां पर इस्तेमाल किया है वहां क्या कहा है। आगे भी मेरे पल्ले नहीं पड़ा। इसलिए दिक्कत हो रही है। आपने कह दिया कि मेरे पास है पढ़ लें। हमें पता नहीं लगा कि आप क्या कह रहे हैं, कहां मिस कर रहे हैं। लफ्जों का खेल है।

†شری سکندر بخت: آپکا بیان پورے طریقے سے سمجھ میں نہیں آیا ہے اور اصل حصّہ ابھی اسکارہ گیا ہے - میں آپ سے کہنا چاہتا ہوں کہ کمپی ٹیٹیو" لفظ کا آپنے جہاں پر استعمال کیا ہے وہاں کیا کہا ہے - آگے بھی میرے پلّے نہیں پڑا - اسلئے دقّت ہو رہی ہے - آپ نے کہہ دیا کہ میرے پاس ہے پڑھ لیں - ہمیں پتہ نہیں لگا کہ آپ کیا کہہ رہے ہیں - کہاں مس کر رہے ہیں لفظوں کا کھیل ہے †

उपसभापति: सारे लफ्ज जो हैं वे सिकन्दर बख्त साहब आपको मंनडे को मालूम होंगे। मंत्री जी जो कह रहे हैं, जो मेरी समझ में आया वह यह है *(Interruptions)* Just one second. What I understood from what he has said is that according to the information that he got, India has not compromised. Now the full text of what has taken place in Singapore can only be received on Monday. Then, what is the point of discussing it now?

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA (Punjab): Madam, I want to ask the Minister *...(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: First, let him speak. Yes, please speak.

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: Madam, how can they compromise the sovereignty of the nation?

†[ ]Transliteration in Arabic Script.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: You can talk about that on Monday. *(Interruptions)* On Monday. *(Interruptions)* We can't have a discussion now.

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA: Madam, I am only interested in *...(Interruptions)*

AN HON. MEMBER: Madam, the Government had given an assurance *...(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Assurance? *...(Interruptions)*

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES (Goa): Madam, it is a minority Government. So, it would be appropriate for this Government to consult the opposition parties and to try...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't remember any such assurance. No such assurance was given before me that nothing will happen without taking the Parliament into confidence. I have no information about it...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI JOHN F. FERNANDES: Madam, this is a minority Government.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: If any assurance is given in the House, we generally know about it through the Assurances Committee. The Assurances Committee takes care of such assurances. I assured you in the morning on this matter, and the Minister is here no...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA: Madam, I want to know from the hon. Minister whether the Cabinet had given its permission to the delegation to go to Singapore for signing the agreement or not. The hon. Minister can clarify whether the Cabinet had given its approval to the delegation to go to Singapore.

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: It was never in the agenda of the Cabinet.

उपसभापति: उनको पूछने दीजिये न (व्यवधान) जब आप कभी केबीनेट मिनिस्टर बनें तो बताना केबीनेट की बातें (व्यवधान) मैं नहीं समझती कि केबीनेट की बातें हाऊस में हो सकती हैं। केबीनेट में क्या होता है-

We are not supposed to know it. That is not my concern. Let us not go beyond a certain point.

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA: Madam, I am on a specific point. I want to know whether the Cabinet had given its permission to the delegation to sign the agreement in Singapore or not. This is number one. Secondly, by when the Minister is going to give us the papers that he is going to present to us so that we could form our opinion on the matter? When is he going to give it to us? ...*(Interruptions)*

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: What are we discussing today? What are we really discussing today? ...*(Interruptions)*... We have nothing in our hands just now. What are we doing here? What are we really discussing?

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Madam, the Commerce Minister should come back...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN: India's sovereignty is being...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I am asking you as to what we are discussing here...*(Interruptions)*...

DR. ALLADI P. RAJKUMAR (Andhra Pradesh): Madam, let it be circulated. ...*(Interruptions)*... The Commerce Minister is also coming on Monday.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, it is a very important matter. All of us are concerned about the situation. It is in the fitness of things that the Government should have talks with leaders of different parties. The Government did not have any talks with the leaders of different parties as to what it is going to do. I would like to know from the hon. Minister as to when the Commerce Minister is coming back so that we could fix up some discussion on this matter. We want a full-fledged discussion on it.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: This is a very sensible suggestion.

SYED SIBTEY RAZI: Madam, till now we have not made up our mind to ratify or enter into such types of negotiations. Of course, it is your right to go to any international fora, but it is in the fitness of things that you could have informed the Parliament when it is in session. At least, you could have discussed the matter with the leaders of different political parties. The Government has committed a mistake on this point. But, even then if you can assure us that within 24 hours or on Monday the Commerce Minister will be here so and we could have a clear picture of the whole situation, we could discuss it.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA Madam...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Shri Mitra wants to say something.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA (West Bengal): Madam...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Mr. Mitra, don't get agitated. When somebody is speaking, I cannot make him sit down and allow you ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ASHOK MITRA: Madam, I want to have my say.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Okay, say what you want to say. ...*(Interruptions)*... But, why do you argue with the Chair? I don't understand.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA: Madam, I want to have my say.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: He is an expert.

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: Nobody is an expert in this House.

SHRI ASHOK MITRA: I want to have my say ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: I don't like this attitude. It is not my problem ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI ASHOK MITRA: Madam, for the last ten minutes, I have been trying to draw your attention, but if your eyes are diverted...

THE DEPUTY CHAIRMAN: No, it is not my eyes. Don't put the blame on the Chair. I am going to adjourn the House for the day. The House is adjourned till 11 a.m. on Monday.

The House then adjourned at nineteen minutes past two of the clock till eleven of the clock on Monday, the 16th December, 1996.